

ACADEMIC QUALITY ASSURANCE MODEL IN ENHANCING THE COMPETITIVE ADVANTAGE OF NAHDLATUL ULAMA UNIVERSITY

Siti Nur Afifah¹, Abd. Haris² M. Fahim Tharaba³

^{1,2,3}Universitas Islam Negeri Maulana Malik Ibrahim, Malang, Indonesia

Email: 230106310001@student.uin-malang.ac.id¹, abd.haris@uin-malang.ac.id²,
fahimtarbiyah@pai.uin-malang.ac.id³

Abstrak: Penjaminan mutu akademik telah menjadi kebutuhan strategis di tengah persaingan global, transformasi digital, dan tuntutan pencapaian Tujuan Pembangunan Berkelanjutan (Sustainable Development Goals/SDGs). Namun, perguruan tinggi yang berafiliasi dengan Nahdlatul Ulama (PTNU) menghadapi tantangan tambahan berupa penyelarasan antara pemenuhan standar akademik nasional dan pelestarian identitas kelembagaan Ahlussunnah wal Jama'ah (Aswaja). Penelitian ini bertujuan untuk menganalisis dan mengembangkan model penjaminan mutu akademik dalam memperkuat keunggulan bersaing perguruan tinggi Nahdlatul Ulama. Penelitian menggunakan pendekatan kualitatif dengan desain studi multisitus di Universitas Islam Malang dan Universitas Nahdlatul Ulama Surabaya. Data dikumpulkan melalui wawancara mendalam, observasi partisipatif, dan analisis dokumen yang melibatkan pimpinan universitas, unit penjaminan mutu, dosen, serta para pemangku kepentingan institusi. Data dianalisis menggunakan teknik kondensasi data, penyajian data, dan perbandingan lintas situs secara interaktif. Hasil penelitian menunjukkan bahwa kedua perguruan tinggi menerapkan penjaminan mutu melalui kebijakan yang terintegrasi, evaluasi berkelanjutan, tata kelola berbasis digital, serta internalisasi nilai-nilai Aswaja An-Nahdliyah ke dalam budaya akademik. Berbeda dengan model Total Quality Management (TQM) konvensional yang memandang budaya institusi hanya sebagai konteks pendukung, kebaruan utama penelitian ini terletak pada temuan bahwa identitas ideologis Islam berfungsi sebagai sumber daya tata kelola yang aktif dan sulit ditiru, yang secara langsung membentuk perumusan kebijakan serta menghasilkan capaian institusional yang terukur, seperti akreditasi yang unggul, meningkatnya kepercayaan para pemangku kepentingan, dan pengakuan di tingkat internasional. Penelitian ini memberikan kontribusi berupa model penjaminan mutu akademik berbasis nilai yang kontekstual bagi perguruan tinggi Islam, sekaligus menawarkan panduan strategis bagi para pimpinan perguruan tinggi dan pembuat kebijakan dalam menyelaraskan tata kelola akademik dengan identitas kelembagaan pada perguruan tinggi berbasis keagamaan.

Kata kunci:

Penjaminan Mutu Akademik; Keunggulan Bersaing; Perguruan Tinggi Nahdlatul Ulama (PTNU); Ahlussunnah wal Jama'ah; Studi Multisitus.

Abstract: Academic quality assurance has become a strategic necessity amid global competition, digital transformation, and the Sustainable Development Goals, yet universities affiliated with Nahdlatul Ulama (PTNU) face the added challenge of reconciling national academic standards with the preservation of Ahlussunnah wal Jama'ah institutional identity. This study analyzes and develops an academic quality assurance model for strengthening the competitive advantage of PTNU institutions. Employing a qualitative multisite case study at Universitas Islam Malang and Universitas Nahdlatul Ulama Surabaya, data were collected through in-depth interviews, participant observation, and document analysis with university leaders, quality assurance units, lecturers, and institutional stakeholders, and analyzed using interactive data condensation, display, and cross-site comparison. Both institutions implement quality assurance through integrated policies, continuous evaluation, digital governance, and the internalization of Aswaja An-Nahdliyah values into academic culture. Unlike conventional Total Quality Management models that treat institutional culture as peripheral context, this

study's central novelty is demonstrating that Islamic ideological identity functions as an active, difficult-to-replicate governance resource that directly shapes policy formulation and translates into measurable institutional gains, including superior accreditation, stronger stakeholder trust, and international recognition. The study contributes a contextual, value-based academic quality assurance model for Islamic higher education and offers strategic guidance for university leaders and policymakers seeking to align academic governance with institutional identity in faith-based universities.

Keywords: Academic Quality Assurance; Competitive Advantage; PTNU; Ahlussunnah wal Jama'ah; Multisite Study.

Introduction

Higher education institutions across the world are currently facing unprecedented challenges driven by globalization, technological disruption, international competition, and the rapid transformation of knowledge economies (Mehboob Ul Hassan, et al, 2024). Universities are no longer assessed solely based on their ability to provide educational services, but also on their capacity to produce innovation, strengthen institutional reputation, develop globally competitive graduates, and contribute to sustainable development goals (SDGs) (M. Chankseliani and T. McCowan, 2020). This shift in evaluative criteria is reflected starkly in global league tables: in the most recent QS World University Rankings, Indonesia's highest-placed institution, Universitas Indonesia, sits just outside the global top 180, a positional gap that persists even though Indonesia fielded the largest number of newly ranked universities of any Asian higher education system in the 2025 cycle (QS Quacquarelli Symonds, 2025, 2027). The implementation of quality assurance systems has therefore become a strategic necessity for universities seeking to maintain academic relevance and institutional sustainability in the era of globalization. According to United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization, quality education represents one of the primary pillars of sustainable development and is explicitly emphasized in Sustainable Development Goal 4 concerning inclusive and equitable quality education. In this context, higher education institutions are required to establish adaptive, measurable, and sustainable quality assurance mechanisms capable of responding to global educational transformations (T. McCowan, 2023).

The urgency of strengthening quality assurance in higher education is increasingly evident in developing countries, including Indonesia, where educational competitiveness remains relatively low compared to neighboring countries in Southeast Asia. International assessment reports indicate that the quality of Indonesian education still faces serious structural challenges (Novihta Sampe and Zainal Arifin, 2024). The Programme for International Student Assessment (PISA), developed by the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development, consistently shows that Indonesian students' literacy, numeracy, and scientific competencies remain below the OECD average (R.S Umbase, 2023). Similarly, UNESCO reports continue to position Indonesia below several ASEAN countries in educational quality indicators. These conditions indicate that educational institutions in Indonesia must strengthen institutional governance, academic culture, and quality assurance systems to improve competitiveness and public trust (Andi Arif Rifa'i, 2019; A Mursidi, 2022).

Within the higher education sector, the challenge becomes more complex for Islamic higher education institutions, particularly those affiliated with Nahdlatul Ulama (Mardan Umar, et al, 2024). Nahdlatul Ulama Higher Education Institutions (Perguruan Tinggi Nahdlatul Ulama/PTNU) possess distinctive institutional characteristics because they simultaneously carry academic responsibilities and ideological missions rooted in Ahlussunnah wal Jama'ah An-Nahdliyah values (T. Yugo, 2025; A. Rozaq, et al, 2020). Consequently, quality assurance in PTNU cannot merely focus on compliance with national academic standards but must also ensure the preservation of religious identity, moderate Islamic values, and organizational sustainability (Umi Musaropah, et al., 2020). This dual responsibility creates a unique challenge in designing academic quality assurance systems that are capable of balancing academic excellence and ideological reinforcement (Hanafiah, et al, 2024).

The growing demand for institutional competitiveness has encouraged universities to adopt various quality assurance strategies (Moh Ali Fauzi, et al., 2024). In Indonesia, the implementation of the Internal Quality Assurance System (SPMI) and External Quality Assurance System (SPME) has become a national policy framework for improving higher education quality (Fatma Tresno Ingtyas, et al, 2022). However, many higher education institutions continue to experience difficulties in implementing sustainable quality assurance systems due to limitations in human resources, governance structures, technological adaptation, and organizational commitment (E. Elbadiansyah and M. Masyni, 2021). These challenges become more apparent in Islamic higher education institutions, where institutional quality assurance must operate within broader socio-religious and cultural frameworks (Anik Herminingsih, and Rizka Doni Agung Saputra, 2025).

Previous studies have highlighted the importance of quality assurance systems in improving higher

education performance. Dehma Mofleh Qasem Al Maraghi et al (2024). explained that quality assurance mechanisms in higher education rely on internal and external evaluation systems, curriculum monitoring, and stakeholder collaboration to achieve educational standards. The study emphasized the importance of institutional commitment and continuous evaluation in maintaining educational quality. Similarly, Mustafa Kayyali et al (2023). argued that quality assurance frameworks in higher education require standardized systems and adaptive governance mechanisms capable of responding to institutional and societal changes. These studies provide important conceptual foundations regarding the implementation of quality assurance systems in higher education institutions.

Further research by Yasir Javed et al (2023). demonstrated that sustainable quality assurance requires long-term strategic planning, strong performance indicators, and effective data management systems to support institutional sustainability. The study also emphasized the necessity of integrating quality assurance with institutional development strategies. Meanwhile, Budi Rizka et al, (2024) analyzed the implementation of national higher education standards in Indonesia and found that institutional readiness, leadership support, and organizational culture significantly influence the effectiveness of quality assurance implementation. Their findings revealed that many institutions still struggle to achieve sustainable quality improvements because quality assurance is often implemented merely as an administrative requirement rather than a strategic institutional culture.

Studies related to competitiveness in higher education have also shown that institutional quality strongly influences organizational performance and public trust (Sari Sakarina, et al, 2021). Fariz et al, (2022) identified that lecturer competence, curriculum relevance, and academic governance contribute significantly to institutional competitiveness. Likewise, Fajar Arianto et al. (2023) found that quality assurance practices positively affect postgraduate academic performance through systematic evaluation, curriculum management, and continuous improvement mechanisms. These findings indicate that quality assurance should not only function as a regulatory instrument but also as a strategic tool for enhancing institutional competitiveness (Boshra A. Arnout, et al, 2024).

Although previous studies provide important insights into higher education quality assurance, several limitations remain evident. First, most existing studies focus primarily on general higher education institutions without considering the unique characteristics of faith-based universities, particularly those affiliated with Nahdlatul Ulama. Second, previous studies generally emphasize technical and administrative aspects of quality assurance while paying limited attention to the integration of religious values, institutional ideology, and cultural identity into quality assurance systems. Third, many studies examine quality assurance solely from the perspective of accreditation compliance and institutional accountability, rather than positioning quality assurance as a strategic instrument for building sustainable competitive advantage. Fourth, existing studies are predominantly conducted using single-site approaches, limiting the contextual richness and comparative understanding of institutional quality assurance practices.

These limitations indicate a significant research gap in the literature on higher education quality assurance. There remains limited empirical research exploring how academic quality assurance systems can be integrated with religious values, institutional culture, and competitiveness strategies within Nahdlatul Ulama higher education institutions. Furthermore, previous studies have not sufficiently examined how quality assurance systems can function simultaneously as mechanisms for academic improvement, ideological reinforcement, and institutional differentiation in the context of Islamic higher education. The absence of contextual models specifically designed for PTNU institutions highlights the need for further investigation into adaptive and culturally grounded academic quality assurance systems.

This study addresses these gaps by investigating academic quality assurance models in two leading Nahdlatul Ulama universities, namely Universitas Islam Malang and Universitas Nahdlatul Ulama Surabaya. Both institutions represent prominent PTNU universities that have successfully achieved superior institutional accreditation and national recognition in quality assurance implementation. Their experiences provide important empirical contexts for understanding how academic quality assurance systems are developed, implemented, and institutionalized within Islamic higher education environments.

The novelty of this study lies in several important aspects. First, this research develops a contextual academic quality assurance model specifically designed for Nahdlatul Ulama higher education institutions by integrating academic standards, organizational governance, and Ahlul sunnah wal Jama'ah values within a unified framework (Mulyono, et. Al, 2021). Second, this study positions quality assurance not merely as a compliance mechanism but as a strategic instrument for strengthening institutional competitiveness, public legitimacy, and organizational sustainability (Nora Saiva Jannana, et al, 2025). Third, unlike previous studies that generally adopt single-case approaches, this research employs a multisite qualitative design involving two leading PTNU institutions, enabling

broader comparative analysis and stronger contextual validity (A. Rozaq, et al, 2020). Fourth, this study contributes to the development of Islamic higher education management literature by integrating spiritual values, academic quality culture, and competitive advantage into a comprehensive institutional quality assurance model (Luthfiatul Udhma, and Sri Minarti, 2025).

Theoretically, this study contributes to expanding the discourse on higher education quality assurance by emphasizing the importance of integrating institutional identity, cultural values, and strategic competitiveness into quality management systems (Vakulenko, Vitalii, et al, 2025). The study also enriches educational management theory by demonstrating that quality assurance systems in faith-based universities cannot be separated from ideological and socio-cultural dimensions (L. Moldovan, 2012). Practically, the findings are expected to provide strategic recommendations for university leaders, policymakers, and quality assurance agencies in designing sustainable academic quality assurance systems capable of improving institutional performance and competitiveness (Quirós Teixeira, Joaquín, et al, 2022).

Based on these considerations, this study aims to analyze and develop an academic quality assurance model for improving the competitive advantage of Nahdlatul Ulama higher education institutions through a multisite study at Universitas Islam Malang and Universitas Nahdlatul Ulama Surabaya. Specifically, this research seeks to examine: (1) academic quality assurance policies implemented in PTNU institutions, (2) the processes and mechanisms of academic quality assurance implementation, and (3) the institutional impacts of academic quality assurance on competitive advantage and organizational sustainability. Through these objectives, the study intends to formulate a contextual, adaptive, and sustainable academic quality assurance model that can strengthen the competitiveness of Islamic higher education institutions in the global era.

Method

This study employed a qualitative research approach using a multisite case study design. The qualitative approach was selected because the study aimed to explore deeply the processes, policies, values, and institutional practices underlying academic quality assurance in Nahdlatul Ulama higher education institutions. According to Creswell, qualitative research enables researchers to investigate social phenomena in their natural settings and interpret meanings constructed by participants through interaction and experience. A multisite design was adopted to generate comparative and contextual understanding across different institutional environments while identifying common patterns and distinctive practices in academic quality assurance implementation (Yin, 2018; Susan Carter, 2020). This design was considered appropriate because the study focused on developing a contextual model of academic quality assurance in faith-based higher education institutions.

The research was conducted at Universitas Islam Malang and Universitas Nahdlatul Ulama Surabaya. These institutions were selected purposively because both universities represent leading Nahdlatul Ulama higher education institutions with superior institutional accreditation and recognized achievements in academic quality assurance implementation. The research was conducted from September 2024 to February 2025, allowing sufficient time for intensive field engagement, repeated observations, and cross-site data verification.

Research participants consisted of university leaders, quality assurance administrators, faculty deans, lecturers, internal auditors, and institutional stakeholders directly involved in academic quality assurance processes. *[Author: insert the total number of participants and the per-institution breakdown here, e.g., "A total of N participants were involved, comprising n at Universitas Islam Malang and n at Universitas Nahdlatul Ulama Surabaya, including X university leaders, X quality assurance administrators, X faculty deans, X lecturers, and X internal auditors at each site."]* Participants were selected using purposive and snowball sampling techniques. Purposive sampling was applied to identify individuals possessing strategic roles and substantial knowledge regarding institutional quality assurance practices, while snowball sampling enabled the researcher to identify additional relevant participants based on recommendations from initial informants (Patton, 2015; L. Palinkas, et al, 2015). This sampling strategy ensured the inclusion of diverse perspectives and rich empirical data relevant to the research objectives. Recruitment at each site continued until thematic saturation was reached, operationalized as the point at which successive interviews no longer surfaced new categories relevant to the three research foci quality assurance policy, implementation process, and institutional impact.

The primary research instrument in this study was the researcher as a human instrument, supported by semi-structured interview guidelines, observation protocols, and document analysis checklists. Lincoln and Guba emphasized that qualitative researchers function as the primary instruments because they are capable of adapting flexibly to field situations and interpreting complex social realities (Lincoln & Guba, 1985). The interview guidelines focused on institutional quality assurance policies, implementation mechanisms, governance practices, and competitiveness strategies. Observation protocols were used to examine organizational culture, academic activities,

and quality assurance practices, while document analysis included institutional policies, accreditation reports, strategic plans, quality manuals, and evaluation documents.

Data collection procedures involved in-depth interviews, participant observation, and documentation studies. In-depth interviews were conducted face-to-face with institutional leaders and quality assurance stakeholders to obtain comprehensive information regarding quality assurance implementation and institutional competitiveness. Participant observation was undertaken to examine institutional practices, organizational culture, and quality assurance activities in their natural contexts. In addition, documentation studies were conducted to strengthen empirical evidence and validate findings obtained from interviews and observations. The combination of these techniques enabled methodological triangulation and improved data richness (Merriam & Tisdell, 2016).

Data analysis employed an interactive model developed by Miles, Huberman, and Saldaña, consisting of data condensation, data display, conclusion drawing, and verification processes (M. Miles and A. Huberman, 1994; J. Saldaña, 2020). The analysis began with organizing and reducing raw data obtained from interviews, observations, and documents. Subsequently, the data were categorized thematically based on research focuses, including quality assurance policies, implementation processes, and institutional impacts. Cross-site analysis was then conducted to identify similarities, differences, and emerging patterns between the two universities. Finally, conclusions were verified continuously through repeated interpretation and comparison with field evidence to ensure analytical consistency and conceptual validity.

To ensure trustworthiness, this study applied credibility, dependability, confirmability, and transferability criteria as proposed by (Y. Lincoln and E. Guba, 1985; G. Lincoln et al, 2019). Credibility was established through prolonged engagement, triangulation of data sources and methods, member checking, and peer debriefing. Dependability was maintained through detailed documentation of research procedures, field notes, and analytical decisions to ensure research consistency and transparency. Confirmability was achieved by maintaining an audit trail and ensuring that interpretations were grounded in empirical evidence rather than researcher bias. Meanwhile, transferability was strengthened through thick description of institutional contexts, participant experiences, and research findings, enabling readers to assess the applicability of findings in similar educational settings.

Findings

1. Academic Quality Assurance Policies

Both universities implemented integrated academic quality assurance policies aligned with national higher education standards and institutional visions. The policies emphasized continuous improvement, strengthening academic governance, digital transformation, lecturer development, and the internalization of Ahlussunnah wal Jama'ah values into academic activities.

At UNISMA, academic quality policies were directed toward achieving international standards through strengthening governance systems, accreditation, and international collaboration. Meanwhile, UNUSA emphasized innovation-based governance, entrepreneurial culture, and Islamic institutional identity as part of its quality assurance orientation. These policy orientations are reflected in each institution's documented accreditation trajectory. UNISMA holds institutional accreditation Unggul (Excellent) from BAN-PT (SK No. 1753/SK/BAN-PT/Ak/PT/X/2022) and has additionally pursued international program-level recognition through ASIIN and FIBAA (Germany), consistent with its stated orientation toward international standards. UNUSA, by contrast, obtained institutional accreditation Unggul from BAN-PT (SK No. 946/SK/BAN-PT/Ak/PT/XI/2023) at only ten years of institutional age, making it one of the fastest Indonesian private higher education institutions to reach this status, with more than half of its study programs independently accredited Unggul—an achievement consistent with its innovation-and-entrepreneurship-driven governance orientation. These documentary facts corroborate informant accounts and illustrate that policy orientation in both universities is not merely declarative but traceable to verifiable institutional outcomes.

The findings indicate that quality assurance policies in both institutions function not only as administrative instruments but also as strategic frameworks for institutional development and competitiveness.

Table 1. Academic Quality Assurance Policy Orientation

Aspect	UNISMA				UNUSA
Main Orientation	International academic excellence				Entrepreneurial and Islamic excellence
Quality Focus	Accreditation and global competitiveness				Innovation and institutional governance
Institutional Values	Aswaja An-Nahdliyah				Rahmatan Lil 'Alamin
Strategic Priority	Internationalization and governance				Digital transformation and competitiveness
Documented Accreditation	Institutional accreditation Unggul (BAN-PT	SK	No.	1753/SK/BAN-	Institutional accreditation Unggul (BAN-PT SK No. 946/SK/BAN-PT/Ak/PT/XI/2023)

Outcome	PT/Ak/PT/X/2022); international accreditation (ASIIN, FIBAA)	program-level (ASIIN, FIBAA)	achieved at 10 years of institutional age; >50% of 20 study programs independently accredited Unggul
One quality assurance leader at UNISMA stated: “Academic quality assurance is not only about accreditation documents, but also about creating a sustainable academic culture and strengthening institutional trust.” Similarly, a senior administrator at UNUSA explained: “Quality assurance in our university integrates academic achievement, Islamic values, and innovation to strengthen institutional competitiveness.” These findings show that both universities positioned quality assurance as a long-term institutional strategy rather than merely fulfilling government regulations. Read thematically, the two statements reveal a subtle but important divergence beneath their surface similarity. The UNISMA informant defines quality assurance in opposition to documentation (“not only about accreditation documents”), positioning culture and trust as the deeper object the documentation merely evidences; this framing is consistent with UNISMA’s internationalization-oriented policy and its pursuit of accreditation as a signal directed outward, toward global academic legitimacy. The UNUSA informant, by contrast, frames quality assurance as an integration of three co-equal elements achievement, Islamic values, and innovation without subordinating any one to the others, a horizontal framing consistent with UNUSA’s entrepreneurial and innovation-driven governance orientation. This difference in framing—quality as a deeper truth behind documentation at UNISMA, versus quality as a tripartite balance at UNUSA—was corroborated by document analysis: UNISMA’s strategic plan and quality manual foreground international benchmarking language, whereas UNUSA’s strategic plan foregrounds innovation and entrepreneurship indicators alongside religious-character indicators, matching the verbatim emphasis of each institution’s informants and providing methodological triangulation between interview and documentary data.			

2. Quality Assurance Implementation Processes

The implementation of academic quality assurance in Universitas Islam Malang and Universitas Nahdlatul Ulama Surabaya was carried out systematically through continuous quality management cycles consisting of planning, implementation, evaluation, control, and improvement. Both universities adopted the Internal Quality Assurance System (SPMI) framework as the foundation for managing academic standards and institutional performance. The implementation process involved university leaders, quality assurance units, faculty administrators, lecturers, and supporting staff to ensure that quality assurance became part of institutional culture rather than merely administrative compliance.

The findings revealed that both institutions integrated academic quality assurance into strategic governance and operational management. Academic standards were formulated based on national higher education standards, institutional vision, and organizational values. The implementation covered curriculum development, lecturer performance evaluation, academic monitoring, student learning assessment, research productivity, and community service performance. Quality assurance activities were conducted regularly through internal audits, coordination meetings, curriculum reviews, and accreditation preparation programs. This systematic approach enabled both universities to maintain consistency in achieving institutional quality targets.

Digital transformation also played a significant role in supporting quality assurance implementation. Both universities utilized integrated information systems to monitor academic performance, lecturer activities, student achievement, and institutional evaluation processes. The use of digital platforms improved efficiency, transparency, and accuracy in quality monitoring and reporting. A quality assurance staff member at UNUSA explained:

“Digital systems help us monitor academic performance effectively and make quality assurance processes faster and more transparent.”

Similarly, continuous evaluation became a key component in sustaining quality assurance implementation. Evaluation results were used as the basis for corrective actions, policy revision, and institutional improvement programs. Leadership commitment was identified as an important factor in ensuring the sustainability of quality assurance practices. Institutional leaders consistently supervised academic units, encouraged innovation, and strengthened quality culture across faculties and departments. A lecturer from UNISMA stated:

“Every academic activity is monitored through quality standards. Evaluation is conducted regularly, and improvement becomes part of the institutional culture.”

The study further found that the integration of Ahlussunnah wal Jama’ah values into academic governance strengthened institutional identity and organizational cohesion. Islamic values were reflected in leadership practices, academic ethics, curriculum orientation, and institutional decision-making processes. This integration

created a distinctive model of academic quality assurance that combined academic excellence, spiritual values, and institutional competitiveness within Nahdlatul Ulama higher education institutions.

3. The Impacts of Academic Quality Assurance on Institutional Competitiveness

The implementation of academic quality assurance produced significant impacts on institutional competitiveness in both universities. The findings demonstrated improvements in institutional accreditation, public trust, academic reputation, student enrollment, lecturer performance, and international recognition.

Both universities successfully achieved superior institutional accreditation and strengthened their positions among leading Nahdlatul Ulama universities in Indonesia. The implementation of systematic quality assurance also contributed to stronger governance systems and improved stakeholder satisfaction.

Table 3. Impacts of Academic Quality Assurance

Impact Area	Findings
Institutional Accreditation	Institutional accreditation Unggul at both sites (UNISMA: SK 1753/2022; UNUSA: SK 946/2023, reached at 10 years of institutional age, >50% of programs independently Unggul)
Academic Reputation	Increased national and international recognition
Stakeholder Trust	Higher public confidence and student enrollment
Lecturer Performance	Improved academic productivity and evaluation outcomes
Competitiveness	Stronger institutional positioning among PTNU

The findings demonstrate that academic quality assurance has become a strategic driver for strengthening institutional competitiveness in the global higher education environment. In the era of internationalization, universities are increasingly evaluated based on accreditation quality, research productivity, governance performance, innovation capacity, and graduate competitiveness. The implementation of systematic quality assurance enabled both Universitas Islam Malang and Universitas Nahdlatul Ulama Surabaya to improve institutional credibility and strengthen their visibility within national and international academic networks.

The study found that continuous quality assurance practices contributed significantly to improving academic governance and institutional adaptability amid rapid global changes. Universities that consistently implement evaluation, monitoring, and continuous improvement mechanisms are more capable of responding to technological disruption, policy transformation, and international academic competition. In this context, academic quality assurance functions not only as a compliance mechanism but also as a strategic framework for sustaining institutional resilience and long-term development.

Another important finding is that the integration of Islamic values and institutional identity into quality assurance systems created a distinctive competitive advantage for both universities. In many global higher education systems, institutional differentiation has become increasingly important because universities compete not only through academic rankings but also through institutional uniqueness, social legitimacy, and value-based educational orientation. The incorporation of Ahlussunnah wal Jama'ah values into academic governance strengthened organizational culture, institutional trust, and public legitimacy, particularly within faith-based educational communities.

The implementation of quality assurance also contributed to increasing stakeholder confidence, including students, parents, government institutions, and external partners. Strong accreditation performance and effective governance systems enhanced institutional reputation and expanded opportunities for academic collaboration, research partnerships, and international engagement. These findings indicate that quality assurance has direct implications for institutional sustainability because public trust increasingly determines university competitiveness in the global educational marketplace.

Furthermore, the findings reveal that digital-based quality management systems improved organizational efficiency and institutional responsiveness. The use of integrated academic information systems enabled universities to monitor performance indicators, evaluate academic outcomes, and support evidence-based decision making more effectively. This condition reflects broader global trends in higher education where digital governance and data-driven quality management have become essential components of institutional competitiveness.

Overall, the results confirm that academic quality assurance in Nahdlatul Ulama higher education institutions extends beyond internal academic control. It serves as a strategic instrument for strengthening institutional reputation, maintaining organizational identity, improving global competitiveness, and ensuring sustainable institutional development in an increasingly competitive international higher education landscape.

Figure 1. Model of Academic Quality Assurance in PTNU

Core Components	Institutional Outcomes
Quality Policy Integration	Institutional Competitiveness
Leadership Commitment	Academic Reputation
Digital Quality Management	Governance Effectiveness
Continuous Evaluation	Sustainable Improvement
Integration of Aswaja Values	Institutional Differentiation

Based on cross-site analysis, the study identified a contextual academic quality assurance model characterized by five interconnected dimensions: integrated quality policies, leadership commitment, digital quality management, continuous evaluation, and integration of Islamic values. These dimensions collectively strengthened institutional competitiveness and sustainability in Nahdlatul Ulama higher education institutions.

Overall, the findings demonstrate that academic quality assurance in PTNU institutions functions not only as a regulatory mechanism but also as a strategic instrument for strengthening institutional identity, improving governance quality, and building sustainable competitive advantage in the global higher education environment.

Discussion

1. Academic Quality Assurance Policies

The findings indicate that academic quality assurance policies in Universitas Islam Malang and Universitas Nahdlatul Ulama Surabaya have evolved beyond administrative compliance toward strategic institutional governance. Both universities positioned quality assurance as an integrated framework for strengthening academic excellence, organizational sustainability, and institutional competitiveness. This finding demonstrates that quality assurance policies are no longer viewed merely as accreditation requirements but as strategic instruments for institutional transformation in the global higher education environment. This condition aligns with the argument that universities today are required to establish adaptive and sustainable quality assurance mechanisms capable of responding to globalization, technological disruption, and knowledge economy transformation (Mehboob Ul Hassan et al., 2024; T. McCowan, 2023).

These findings are consistent with previous studies emphasizing that higher education quality assurance contributes significantly to institutional effectiveness and competitiveness. Research conducted by Mustafa Kayyali et al. (2023) explained that quality assurance systems strengthen institutional governance and organizational adaptability through standardized frameworks and continuous evaluation mechanisms. Similarly, Budi Rizka et al. (2024) argued that sustainable quality assurance supports institutional accountability and academic performance improvement. However, the present study extends previous findings by demonstrating that quality assurance in Nahdlatul Ulama universities also functions as a mechanism for preserving institutional ideology and religious identity. This dimension has received limited attention in earlier higher education quality assurance studies. This extension is not merely additive, however; it surfaces a tension that the standardized-framework literature does not adequately confront. Kayyali et al. (2023) and comparable standardized models implicitly treat quality criteria as ideologically neutral and portable across institutional contexts a single accountability logic applicable regardless of an institution's founding values. The present findings complicate that assumption: at both UNISMA and UNUSA, quality assurance criteria are not religiously neutral but are explicitly co-determined by Ahlussunnah wal Jama'ah commitments, which means the "standardized framework" these institutions report to national and international accreditors (BAN-PT, ASIIN, FIBAA) is, in practice, locally re-interpreted through a non-negotiable ideological filter before implementation. This raises a critical question the standardized-framework literature has not addressed: whether a genuinely portable, institution-neutral quality assurance logic is achievable at all in faith-based universities, or whether what such institutions report as compliance with standardized frameworks is better understood as a negotiated translation between two only partially compatible accountability systems—one bureaucratic-secular, one religio-ideological. The data from this study cannot resolve this tension, but they indicate it exists and is actively managed rather than absent, which is a more critical and less comfortable conclusion than the additive framing of "extending" the literature would suggest.

From a theoretical perspective, the findings reinforce Total Quality Management (TQM) theory in education, which emphasizes continuous improvement, stakeholder involvement, and institutional commitment to quality enhancement. Nevertheless, this study also reveals an important contextual difference. Unlike conventional TQM models that focus primarily on managerial efficiency, academic quality assurance in PTNU institutions integrates spiritual and ideological dimensions into governance practices. The integration of Ahlussunnah wal Jama'ah values into institutional policies strengthens organizational cohesion and institutional legitimacy. This finding supports the view that quality assurance systems in Islamic higher education institutions

cannot be separated from socio-religious and cultural frameworks (Umi Musaropah et al., 2020; A. Rozaq et al., 2020).

The emergence of such findings is closely related to the socio-cultural characteristics of Nahdlatul Ulama higher education institutions. PTNU universities operate not only as educational organizations but also as institutions carrying religious and social responsibilities. Consequently, institutional policies are designed to balance academic professionalism and Islamic identity. This condition explains why quality assurance policies in both universities emphasize not only academic achievement but also value internalization and institutional character development. (T. Yugo, 2025; Hanafiah et al., 2024).

Theoretically, this study contributes to the development of quality assurance literature by introducing a value-based academic quality assurance perspective within Islamic higher education contexts. The findings demonstrate that institutional ideology and cultural identity can become strategic components of quality governance systems. Practically, the study implies that university leaders and policymakers should integrate institutional values into quality assurance frameworks to strengthen organizational sustainability and public trust. This implication is relevant to the argument that sustainable quality assurance should function not only as a regulatory mechanism but also as a strategic instrument for strengthening institutional competitiveness and long-term organizational sustainability (Nora Saiva Jannana et al., 2025; Vakulenko et al., 2025).

2. Quality Assurance Implementation Processes

The findings reveal that academic quality assurance implementation in both universities was conducted systematically through continuous planning, monitoring, evaluation, control, and improvement mechanisms. The implementation process was strengthened by leadership commitment, stakeholder participation, and digital governance systems. This indicates that sustainable quality assurance requires institutional collaboration and organizational consistency rather than isolated administrative activities. In line with previous studies emphasizing that higher education institutions must establish adaptive and measurable quality assurance mechanisms to maintain institutional sustainability amid global educational transformation (T. McCowan, 2023; Mehboob Ul Hassan et al., 2024).

The findings support previous research conducted by Yasir Javed et al. (2023), which emphasized that sustainable quality assurance implementation depends on strategic planning, continuous evaluation, and effective data management systems. Similarly, Budi Rizka et al. (2024) highlighted the importance of evaluation and monitoring systems in improving institutional performance and maintaining national higher education standards. However, the current study differs from previous research because it identifies the central role of Islamic values in shaping quality assurance practices. Quality assurance processes in both universities were not purely technical mechanisms but were also guided by ethical and spiritual principles embedded within institutional culture.

From a theoretical standpoint, the findings strengthen organizational culture theory, particularly the argument that institutional values influence organizational behavior and governance effectiveness. The implementation of quality assurance in PTNU institutions reflects the interaction between managerial systems and cultural values. This integration creates stronger institutional commitment because quality assurance is perceived not merely as a bureaucratic obligation but as part of collective moral responsibility. This finding supports previous studies stating that quality assurance implementation in Islamic higher education institutions operates within broader socio-religious and cultural frameworks (Anik Herminingsih & Rizka Doni Agung Saputra, 2025; Umi Musaropah et al., 2020).

The results occurred because both universities successfully institutionalized quality assurance within academic routines and organizational structures. Continuous evaluation, internal audits, curriculum reviews, and digital monitoring systems became integral parts of institutional operations. Leadership commitment also played a crucial role in sustaining implementation processes. University leaders consistently encouraged academic units to strengthen quality culture through supervision, coordination, and strategic evaluation. This condition aligns with previous studies emphasizing that institutional readiness, governance structures, and organizational commitment significantly influence the effectiveness of quality assurance implementation (E. Elbadiansyah & M. Masyni, 2021; Fatma Tresno Ingtyas et al., 2022).

This study contributes theoretically by proposing that sustainable academic quality assurance in faith-based universities requires the integration of governance systems, organizational culture, and ethical values. Practically, the findings suggest that universities should strengthen digital quality management systems, continuous evaluation mechanisms, and participatory leadership models to improve institutional performance and governance effectiveness. These implications are relevant to previous arguments that quality assurance should function not only as an accreditation mechanism but also as a strategic instrument for strengthening institutional

sustainability and competitiveness in higher education institutions (Moh Ali Fauzi et al., 2024; Vakulenko et al., 2025).

3. The Impacts of Academic Quality Assurance on Institutional Competitiveness

The findings demonstrate that academic quality assurance significantly contributed to strengthening institutional competitiveness, academic reputation, public trust, and organizational sustainability. Both universities improved institutional accreditation, expanded academic recognition, and strengthened stakeholder confidence through continuous quality improvement mechanisms. These results confirm that quality assurance has become a strategic instrument for enhancing university competitiveness in increasingly competitive global higher education systems. This is consistent with the argument that universities are currently evaluated not only by educational services but also by their ability to strengthen institutional reputation, innovation capacity, and graduate competitiveness within the global knowledge economy (Mehboob Ul Hassan et al., 2024; Chankseliani & McCowan, 2020).

The findings are aligned with previous studies indicating that institutional quality strongly influences higher education competitiveness. Fariz et al. (2022) found that governance quality, lecturer competence, and curriculum effectiveness positively affect institutional performance and public trust. Similarly, Fajar Arianto et al. (2023) concluded that systematic quality assurance improves academic productivity, evaluation systems, and institutional reputation. The present study, however, extends previous findings by demonstrating that institutional competitiveness in Nahdlatul Ulama universities is also shaped by ideological identity and value-based differentiation. In this context, competitiveness is not determined solely by academic indicators but also by institutional character and socio-religious legitimacy.

From a theoretical perspective, the findings support competitive advantage theory, particularly the argument that organizational uniqueness and institutional differentiation influence long-term competitiveness. In the context of PTNU universities, the integration of academic excellence and Islamic values created distinctive institutional characteristics that strengthened public legitimacy and stakeholder trust. This finding supports previous studies explaining that Nahdlatul Ulama higher education institutions possess distinctive organizational identities rooted in Ahlul sunnah wal Jama'ah values, which contribute to institutional differentiation and cultural legitimacy (T. Yugo, 2025; A. Rozaq et al., 2020). Furthermore, the integration of value-based governance and academic quality reflects broader perspectives emphasizing that competitiveness in higher education is closely related to organizational culture and institutional identity (Vakulenko et al., 2025).

The findings emerged because both universities consistently implemented integrated quality assurance systems supported by leadership commitment, digital governance, and continuous institutional evaluation. Quality assurance practices enabled universities to adapt more effectively to policy changes, technological transformation, and international academic competition. Moreover, the incorporation of Aswaja values strengthened institutional cohesion and created a unique academic culture that distinguished the universities from other higher education institutions. This condition aligns with previous studies emphasizing that sustainable quality assurance requires continuous evaluation, governance strengthening, and institutional adaptability to maintain competitiveness and organizational sustainability (Yasir Javed et al., 2023; E. Elbadiansyah & M. Masyni, 2021).

Another important finding is that academic quality assurance increased stakeholder confidence, including students, parents, government institutions, and external partners. Strong accreditation performance and effective governance systems improved institutional reputation and expanded opportunities for academic collaboration, research partnerships, and international engagement. These findings support the view that quality assurance should not function merely as an administrative requirement but as a strategic framework for building institutional trust and strengthening higher education sustainability (Boshra A. Arnout et al., 2024; Moh Ali Fauzi et al., 2024).

Theoretically, this study contributes to higher education management literature by developing a contextual understanding of competitiveness in faith-based universities. The findings demonstrate that institutional competitiveness can be strengthened through the integration of academic governance, organizational culture, and spiritual values. Practically, the results imply that university leaders should position academic quality assurance as a strategic instrument for building institutional reputation, strengthening stakeholder trust, and ensuring long-term organizational sustainability in the global higher education landscape. These implications reinforce previous arguments that sustainable quality assurance systems are essential for improving institutional resilience and competitiveness in rapidly changing higher education environments (T. McCowan, 2023; Nora Saiva Jannana et al., 2025).

Conclusions

This study concludes that academic quality assurance in Nahdlatul Ulama (PTNU) higher education institutions as evidenced in the two institutional cases examined here functions not only as an administrative mechanism for fulfilling national higher education standards but as a dual-purpose strategic instrument that simultaneously builds conventional institutional competitiveness and reproduces religio-ideological identity, two objectives that standardized quality assurance frameworks typically treat as separable but which this study shows are, in PTNU practice, structurally fused at the level of policy formulation itself. What is analytically new here is not simply that integrated policies, continuous evaluation, leadership commitment, digital governance, and value internalization jointly improved accreditation, reputation, stakeholder trust, and performance a pattern broadly consistent with general quality assurance theory but that these gains were achieved through two institutionally distinct configurations of the same underlying logic (an internationalization-and-governance configuration in one case, an innovation-and-entrepreneurship configuration in the other), indicating that value-based quality assurance in PTNU institutions is a generalizable strategic orientation rather than an idiosyncratic feature of any single university. Theoretically, this implies that quality assurance models built on the assumption of ideological neutrality are incomplete when applied to faith-based institutions, and that a fuller model must treat institutional ideology as a structural input to policy formulation rather than an external cultural overlay.

The study further demonstrates that the integration of academic governance and Islamic institutional values creates a distinctive competitive advantage for faith-based universities. Quality assurance practices in both institutions were strengthened by organizational culture, ethical commitment, and institutional identity, enabling universities to maintain academic excellence while preserving religious and social values. The main contribution of this research lies in the development of a contextual academic quality assurance model that integrates quality management, institutional culture, and value-based governance within Islamic higher education institutions. This model enriches higher education management literature by emphasizing that institutional competitiveness is shaped not only by academic performance but also by organizational identity and cultural legitimacy.

Based on these findings, universities should strengthen digital quality management systems, participatory leadership, and continuous improvement mechanisms to maintain institutional adaptability amid global educational transformation. Policymakers and higher education leaders are also encouraged to integrate institutional values into quality assurance frameworks to strengthen organizational sustainability and public legitimacy. Future research may expand this study by involving broader institutional settings, comparative international perspectives, or quantitative approaches to examine the relationship between academic quality assurance, organizational culture, and institutional competitiveness in diverse higher education contexts.

References

- Arianto, Fajar., et al. "Correlation of Quality Assurance on Postgraduate Academic Performance." *International Journal of Social Science and Human Research* (2023). <https://doi.org/10.47191/ijsshr/v6-i10-99>.
- Arnout, B., Alqahtani, T., & Melweth, H. (2024). Competitive capabilities of higher education institutions from their Employees' perspectives: A case study of King Khalid University. *PLOS ONE*, 19. <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0302887>.
- Chankseliani, M., & McCowan, T. (2020). Higher education and the Sustainable Development Goals. *Higher Education*, 81, 1 - 8. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10734-020-00652-w>.
- Carter, S. (2020). Case Study Method and Research Design. *Advances in Early Childhood and K-12 Education*. <https://doi.org/10.4018/978-1-7998-2901-0.ch015>.
- Elbadiansyah, E., & Masyni, M. (2021). The Implementation of Internal Quality Assurance (IQA) In Three Private Universities in Samarinda. *Erudio Journal of Educational Innovation*. <https://doi.org/10.18551/erudio.8-1.5>.
- Fauzi, M., Alim, N., & Harsoyo, R. (2024). Implementation of The Internal Quality Assurance System (SPMI) as An Effort to Improve the Quality of Higher Education in Indonesia. *Jurnal Pendidikan (Teori dan Praktik)*. <https://doi.org/10.26740/jp.v9n2.p175-183>.
- Fariz, F., et al (2022) "Quality Improvement Strategy for Strengthening Higher Education Competitiveness (Studies at the College of Economics in East Java)." *Khazanah Sosial*. <https://doi.org/10.15575/ks.v4i2.17649>.
- Green, J., & Thorogood, N. (2018). Qualitative Methods for Health Research. <https://doi.org/10.4135/9781036234386>.
- Hassan, M., Murtaza, A., & Rashid, K. (2024). Redefining Higher Education Institutions (HEIs) in the Era of Globalisation and Global Crises: A Proposal for Future Sustainability. *European Journal of Education*. <https://doi.org/10.1111/ejed.12822>.
- Hanafiah., Rahman, M., Bahri, S., & H. (2024). Internalisasi Nilai Ahlu Sunnah Wal Jama'ah An-Nahdliyah dalam Kurikulum Program Studi Pendidikan Agama Islam Fakultas Keguruan dan Ilmu Pendidikan Universitas Nahdlatul Ulama Indonesia. *Reslaj: Religion Education Social Laa Roiba Journal*. <https://doi.org/10.47467/reslaj.v6i5.1253>.
- Herminingsih, A., & Saputra, R. (2025). Building Quality Culture of Higher Education by Implementation of Internal Quality Assurance System (An Empirical Evidence). *Eduvest - Journal of Universal Studies*.

- <https://doi.org/10.59188/eduvest.v5i1.50270>.
- Ingtyas, F., Ampera, D., Wahidah, S., & Jahidin, I. (2022). Implementation of Education Quality Assurance System to Improve Internal Quality Assurance Department of Family Welfare Education (PKK) Universitas Negeri Medan. *International Journal of Educational Research & Social Sciences*. <https://doi.org/10.51601/ijersc.v3i5.509>.
- Javed, Yasir., et al. (2023) "A Case Study on Sustainable Quality Assurance in Higher Education." Sustainability. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su15108136>.
- Jannana, N., Sugiyono, S., & Wijayanti, W. (2025). Cyclical and Value-Based Quality Assurance: A Case Study of a Religious Program at an Islamic Senior High School in Indonesia. *Kharisma: Jurnal Administrasi dan Manajemen Pendidikan*. <https://doi.org/10.59373/kharisma.v4i2.102>.
- Kayyali, M., et al. (2023) "An Overview of Quality Assurance in Higher Education: Concepts and Frameworks."
- Lincoln, Y., & Guba, E. (1985). Lincoln, Yvonna, and Egon G. Guba, Naturalistic Inquiry. Beverly Hills, CA: Sage, 1985.
- Lincoln, G., Guba, E., Lincoln, Y., & Guba, Y. (2019). Naturalistic Inquiry Guba Lincoln.
- McCowan, T. (2023). The crosscutting impact of higher education on the Sustainable Development Goals. *International Journal of Educational Development*. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijedudev.2023.102945>.
- Mursidi, A. (2022). Knowledge Management in the Indonesian Higher Education Internal Quality Assurance System Model. *Recent Advances in Knowledge Management [Working Title]*. <https://doi.org/10.5772/intechopen.101874>.
- Musaropah, U., Mahali, M., Delimanugari, D., Suprianto, A., & Nugroho, T. (2020). Internalisasi Nilai Luhur Ahlu Sunnah wal Jama'ah Bagi Pengembangan Karakter kebangsaan Di Perguruan Tinggi. *Nuansa Akademik: Jurnal Pembangunan Masyarakat*. <https://doi.org/10.47200/jnajpm.v5i2.576>.
- Mulyono, E. (2021). Implementation of the Internal Quality Assurance System at UIN Malang Indonesia. *Turkish Journal of Computer and Mathematics Education (TURCOMAT)*. <https://doi.org/10.17762/turcomat.v12i6.2372>.
- Moldovan, L. (2012). Integration of Strategic Management and Quality Assurance in the Romanian Higher Education. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 58, 1458-1465. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2012.09.1132>.
- Miles, M., & Huberman, A. (1994). Qualitative Data Analysis: An Expanded Sourcebook. [https://doi.org/10.1016/s0272-4944\(05\)80231-2](https://doi.org/10.1016/s0272-4944(05)80231-2).
- Patton, M. Q. (1999). Enhancing the quality and credibility of qualitative analysis. *Health Services Research*, 34(5 Pt 2), 1189
- Qasem, Dehma Mofleh Al Maraghi et al. (2024) "Systems and Mechanisms of Applying Quality Assurance in Higher Education." *العلوم التربوية*. <https://doi.org/10.21608/ssj.2024.348020>.
- QS Quacquarelli Symonds. (2025). *QS World University Rankings: Asia 2025*. <https://www.topuniversities.com/world-university-rankings/asia-university-rankings/2025>
- QS Quacquarelli Symonds. (2027). *QS World University Rankings 2027: Top global universities*. <https://www.topuniversities.com/world-university-rankings>
- Rifa'i, A. (2019). Sistem Penjaminan Mutu Pendidikan Tinggi di Indonesia. *Edugama: Jurnal Kependidikan dan Sosial Keagamaan*. <https://doi.org/10.32923/edugama.v5i1.963>.
- Rozaq, A., Slamet, A., Florentinus, T., & Pramono, S. (2020). Quality Assurance of Islamic Religion Based-Universities in Universalism of Ahlussunnah Wal Jama'ah Values. *Proceedings of the International Conference on Science and Education and Technology (ISET 2019)*. <https://doi.org/10.2991/assehr.k.200620.140>.
- Rizka, Budi., et al. "The Implementation of the National Standards for Higher Education Policy as Quality Assurance." *KnE Social Sciences* (2024). <https://doi.org/10.18502/kss.v9i27.17097>.
- Sampe, N., & Arifin, Z. (2024). Internal Quality Assurance System in Indonesia Higher Education: Literature Review. *Indonesian Journal of Educational Research and Review*. <https://doi.org/10.23887/ijerr.v7i1.67925>.
- Shofwan, A., Rohman, M., & Hidayah, C. (2022). Understanding "The Character Building" at Nahdlatul Ulama University Blitar. *SINDA: Comprehensive Journal of Islamic Social Studies*. <https://doi.org/10.28926/sinda.v2i3.472>.
- Subandi, S. (2020). Quality Development Model of Management Islamic Religious Higher Education of Nahdlatul Ulama. 107-121. <https://doi.org/10.25217/ji.v5i2.1195>.
- Saldaña, J. (2020). Qualitative Data Analysis Strategies. <https://doi.org/10.1093/oxfordhb/9780190847388.013.33>.
- Texeira-Quirós, J., Justino, M., Antunes, M., Mucharreira, P., & Nunes, A. (2022). Effects of Innovation, Total Quality Management, and Internationalization on Organizational Performance of Higher Education Institutions. *Frontiers in Psychology*, 13. <https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2022.869638>.
- Umbase, R. (2023). Management of quality assurance and development of the quality culture of higher education in Indonesia. *Multidisciplinary Reviews*. <https://doi.org/10.31893/multirev.2023032>.

- Umar, M., Ismail, F., Rahmi, S., & Arifin, Z. (2024). Transforming of Moderate Character Education in Islamic Educational Institutions. *Nazhruna: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*. <https://doi.org/10.31538/nzh.v7i1.4168>.
- Udhma, L., & Minarti, S. (2025). Integrating Total Quality Management with Islamic Values in Modern Islamic Education. *Managere: Indonesian Journal of Educational Management*. <https://doi.org/10.52627/managere.v7i1.784>.
- Vakulenko, V., Liu, Y., & Plys, O. (2025). Integrated Strategies of Quality Management of Educational Services in Higher Education Institutions. *Herald UNU. International Economic Relations and World Economy*. <https://doi.org/10.32782/2413-9971/2025-56-2>.
- Yugo, T. (2025). Pendidikan Karakter Berbasis Aswaja Nahdlatul Ulama di Era Disrupsi: Antara Tantangan dan Inovasi. *NAHNU: Journal of Nahdlatul Ulama and Contemporary Islamic Studies*. <https://doi.org/10.63875/nahnu.v3i1.70>.